

Can Statewide Emergency Department, Hospital Discharge, and Violent Death Reporting System Data Be Used to Monitor Burden of Firearm-Related Injury and Death in Rhode Island?

Yongwen Jiang, PhD; Megan L. Ranney, MD, MPH; Brian Sullivan, MS; Dennis Hilliard, MS; Samara Viner-Brown, MS; Nicole Alexander-Scott, MD, MPH

ABSTRACT

Context: National data on the epidemiology of firearm injuries and circumstances of firearm deaths are difficult to obtain and often are nonreliable. Since firearm injury and death rates and causes can vary substantially between states, it is critical to consider state-specific data sources.

Objective: In this study, we illustrate how states can systematically examine demographic characteristics, firearm information, type of wound, toxicology tests, precipitating circumstances, and costs to provide a comprehensive picture of firearm injuries and deaths using data sets from a single state with relatively low rates of firearm injury and death.

Design: Cross-sectional study.

Setting: Firearm-related injury data for the period 2005-2014 were obtained from the Rhode Island emergency department and hospital discharge data sets; death data for the same period were obtained from the Rhode Island Violent Death Reporting System.

Main Outcome Measure: Descriptive statistics were used. Healthcare Cost and Utilization Project cost-to-charge ratios were used to convert total hospital charges to costs.

Results: Most firearm-related emergency department visits (55.8%) and hospital discharges (79.2%) in Rhode Island were from assaults; however, most firearm-related deaths were suicides (60.1%). The annual cost of firearm-related hospitalizations was more than \$830,000. Most decedents who died because of firearms tested positive for illicit substances. Nearly a quarter (23.5%) of firearm-related homicides were due to a conflict between the decedent and suspect. More than half (59%) of firearm suicide decedents were reported to have had current mental or physical problems prior to death.

Author Affiliations: Rhode Island Department of Health, Center for Health Data and Analysis, Providence, Rhode Island (Dr Jiang and Ms Viner-Brown); Departments of Epidemiology (Dr Jiang) and Health Services, Policy and Practice (Drs Ranney and Alexander-Scott), School of Public Health, Brown University, Providence, Rhode Island; Injury Prevention Center at Rhode Island Hospital, Providence, Rhode Island (Dr Ranney); Department of Emergency Medicine, Emergency Digital Health Innovation Program, Alpert School of Medicine, Brown University, Providence, Rhode Island (Dr Ranney); Lincoln Police Department, Lincoln, Rhode Island (Mr Sullivan); Rhode Island State Crime Laboratory, University of Rhode Island, Kingston, Rhode Island (Mr Hilliard); Rhode Island Department of Health, Providence, Rhode Island (Dr Alexander-Scott); and Department of Pediatrics and Medicine, Warren Alpert Medical School, Brown University, Providence, Rhode Island (Dr Alexander-Scott).

This manuscript was funded by CDC grant (5U17CE002615) awarded to the Rhode Island Department of Health (RIDOH). The authors thank their data parties: the Center for the Office of State Medical Examiners, the Center for Vital Records at RIDOH, the Rhode Island State Police and local law enforcement agencies, and the State Crime Laboratory, which provided data in a timely manner and are the backbone of RIVDRS. The authors express their special thanks to their data abstractors Karen Foss and Shannon Young, who spent hours compiling the data and constructing sound narratives to

make RIVDRS one of the best NVDRS systems. The authors also thank Kathy Taylor who provided the 2005-2014 emergency department and hospital discharge data.

The findings and conclusions in this report are those of the authors and do not necessarily represent the official position of the Rhode Island Department of Health, Rhode Island Hospital, Brown University, Lincoln Police Department, and Rhode Island State Crime Laboratory.

Institutional review board approval was not needed for this study because all personal identifiers in all of the data used were removed.

The authors of this manuscript have no competing interests and no conflicts of interest to disclose.

Supplemental digital content is available for this article. Direct URL citations appear in the printed text and are provided in the HTML and PDF versions of this article on the journal's Web site (http://www.JPHMP.com).

Correspondence: Yongwen Jiang, PhD, Rhode Island Department of Health, Center for Health Data and Analysis, 3 Capitol Hill, Providence, RI 02908 (Yongwen_Jiang@brown.edu).

Copyright © 2018 Wolters Kluwer Health, Inc. All rights reserved.

DOI: 10.1097/PHH.0000000000000744

137

Conclusions: Understanding the state-specific magnitude and patterns (who, where, factors, etc) of firearm injury and death may help inform local injury prevention efforts. States with similar data sets may want to adopt our analyses. Surveillance of firearm-related injury and death is essential. Dissemination of surveillance findings to key stakeholders is critical in improving firearm injury prevention. States that are not part of the National Violent Death Reporting System (NVDRS) could work with their other data sources to obtain a better picture of violent injuries and deaths to make the best use of resources.

KEY WORDS: accident, assault, death, emergency department visit, firearm, homicide, hospital discharge, injury, Rhode Island Violent Death Reporting System, suicide

irearm-related injuries are a public health epidemic in the United States¹⁻³ and cost more than \$48 billion in medical and work loss costs in the United States, annually.² In 2015 alone, 36 252 Americans were killed, 4,5 almost 85 000 persons visited the emergency department,6 and more than 46 000 were hospitalized or transferred because of firearm injuries. The firearm death rate varies by gender (with the male death rate 6 times higher than that of females)7 and by geography. The national firearm-related injury death rate is 10.3/100 000 population.^{3,8} Alaska had the highest firearm death rate (19.7/100 000 population), followed by Louisiana, Mississippi, Alabama, and Montana.3,9 Hawaii had the lowest firearm death rate (2.8/100 000), followed by Rhode Island (3.3/100 000), Massachusetts, New York, and Connecticut.3,8,9

In Healthy People 2020, established by the US Department of Health & Human Services, the objective IVP-30 is to reduce firearm-related deaths by 10%, and the objective IVP-31 is to reduce nonfatal firearm-related injuries by 10%. Many factors correlate with firearm injury and death, such as age, gender, veteran status, alcohol and substance use, firearm availability, mental health problems, physical health problems, and more; however, some of these factors may be state-specific. It is critical to understand the patterns (who, where, factors, etc.), characteristics, magnitude, and costs of firearm injuries and deaths to develop strategies to prevent them.

Despite the magnitude of firearm injury, there are relatively few peer-reviewed publications on this topic. 13,14 Scarcity of research on firearm injuries stems partly from disproportionately low federal funding for firearm injury prevention, including an explicit lack of appropriations to the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) to research this topic. 15,16 National data on firearm injury patterns are further limited because of inconsistent coding of cause of death, limited data on injury characteristics of firearm injury or death, and limited attention to the variations in epidemiology for the various types of firearm death. 2,11,12,17-20 In addition, few studies of correlates of death in states with lower rates of firearm

death have been completed; theoretically, correlates and causes of firearm injury in low-mortality states may differ from national analyses.

In this analysis, we conducted a state-specific analysis in a state with one of the lowest firearm injury and death rates in the country. We combined 3 validated, reproducible data sets: (1) 2005-2014 statewide emergency department (ED) visit, (2) hospital discharge (HD), and (3) the Rhode Island Violent Death Reporting System. The objective of this study was to systematically examine demographic characteristics, firearm information, wound to body parts, toxicology tests, precipitating circumstances, and costs to inform firearm injury and death prevention.

Methods

Data sources

Emergency department data and HD data were captured from reporting data from the state's 11 acute care general hospitals, which are required by licensure regulations to report data on every ED visit and inpatient discharge to the Rhode Island Department of Health. These statewide ED and HD databases are primarily administrative data systems, designed to capture billing, licensing, and diagnostic information. Data points include patient demographics and clinical information coded to the International Classification of Diseases, Ninth Revision, Clinical Modification (ICD-9-CM).²¹ Hospital discharge data have been available since October 1, 1989, and ED data were first reported in 2005. As most payers require a single bill for patients seen in the same hospital for a single visit or stay, ED visits that included subsequent admissions to the same hospital were included as "HD," not "ED" data.

Cases were selected from the ED and HD billing databases using *ICD-9-CM* external cause of injury codes (E-codes): firearm accident (E922.0-.3, E922.8-.9), firearm suicide or self-inflicted injury (E955.0-.4), firearm assault (E965.0-.4), firearm injury from legal intervention (E970), and firearm injury with undetermined intent (E985.0-.4).^{7,22} Since there were only a few legal intervention cases, we

grouped them with assault/homicide.^{23,24} We excluded firearm injuries because of war (n = 1 for ED visits) and firearm injuries of undetermined intent (n = 17 for hospitalizations) because of small numbers. Therefore, the 4 categories of manner of death for this analysis were unintentional ("accident"), suicide, homicide/legal intervention, and undetermined intent (only for ED visits) (see Supplemental Digital Content Appendix Table A, available at http://links.lww.com/JPHMP/A430, and Table 1).

Rhode Island Violent Death Reporting System is a component of the National Violent Death Reporting System (NVDRS), which is a population- and state-based surveillance system established by the CDC to collect data on all violent deaths and associated risk factors in the United States.^{23,24} The NVDRS links data from coroner/medical examiner reports, death certificates, law enforcement reports, and secondary sources (eg, State Crime Laboratory, National Incident Based Reporting System, Child Death Review Team data) to provide detailed information on decedents' demographics, toxicology, and the circumstances precipitating violent deaths. Rhode Island has participated in NVDRS since 2004.

Types of deaths in Rhode Island Violent Death Reporting System, assigned by abstractors, include suicides (intentional self-harm); homicides (assault); deaths of undetermined intent; unintentional firearm-related deaths; deaths due to legal intervention excluding legal executions; and deaths due to terrorism. For this analysis, deaths of undetermined intent (n = 5) and unintentional firearm deaths (n = 2) were excluded because of small numbers. Therefore, the 2 categories of manner of death for this analysis were homicide/legal intervention and suicide.

Characteristics, toxicology tests, and circumstances

Characteristics of firearm injuries and deaths and their respective categories are shown in Supplemental Digital Content Appendix Table A, available at http: //links.lww.com/JPHMP/A430. Other characteristics, toxicology tests, and circumstances of firearm deaths and their categories are shown in Tables 2 to 4. Blood alcohol concentration, based on toxicological data, was dichotomized into less than 0.08% versus 0.08% or more. In correspondence with CDC standard methods of analysis, 23 the 11 distinct homicide circumstances were classified into 4 broad conceptual groups: (1) crime and criminal activity; (2) interpersonal; (3) life stressor; and (4) homicide event circumstances. The 22 distinct suicide circumstances were similarly classified into 4 broad conceptual groups: (1) mental health/substance abuse; (2) interpersonal; (3) life stressor; and (4) suicide event circumstances. Data about the existence of prior restraining orders were missing for more than 90% of firearm suicide and homicide victims; this data point was therefore not included in our analysis.

Data analyses

Raw counts of firearm injuries and deaths rather than rates were analyzed. It would be far more useful to give rates of injuries or deaths rather than percentages by characteristics. However, the numbers in Rhode Island were very small even when we combined 10 years of data. The CDC requires that states do not report rates for cells with a frequency of less than 20 due to instability. In addition, rates could not be calculated for many characteristics (eg, marital status, toxicology tests, and precipitating circumstances) because the

| TABLE 1 Average Annual Charge, Cost, and Length of Stay by Manner of Firearm-Related Injury, 2005-2014 ^a | | | | | | |
|--|----|-------------|----------|-----------|-----|--|
| | | | | | | |
| ED visit ^b | | | | | | |
| Unintentional | 28 | \$89 052 | \$3180 | \$28 330 | | |
| Assault/Legal intervention | 49 | \$199 828 | \$4078 | \$65 376 | | |
| Suicide attempt | 4 | \$19823 | \$4956 | \$6644 | | |
| Undetermined intent | 6 | \$21 119 | \$3520 | \$6596 | | |
| Total | 87 | \$329 822 | \$3791 | \$106 945 | | |
| Hospitalization | | | | | | |
| Unintentional | 8 | \$319 909 | \$39 989 | \$106 085 | 51 | |
| Assault/Legal intervention | 41 | \$2 080 275 | \$50 738 | \$669 772 | 302 | |
| Suicide attempt | 3 | \$167 234 | \$55 745 | \$54 954 | 26 | |
| Total | 52 | \$2 567 418 | \$49 373 | \$830 812 | 380 | |

Abbreviations: ED, emergency department; LOS, length of stay.

^a From Rhode Island emergency department visit and hospital discharge data.

^bEmergency department visits in this analysis do not include those subsequent admissions to the same hospital.

TABLE 2

Characteristics of Firearm Homicide/Legal Intervention and Suicide Death, Rhode Island, 2005-2014^a

| | Interve | Homicide/Legal Intervention (n = 173) | | cide : 261) |
|---|--------------|---|------------|----------------|
| Characteristics of Firearm Death | n | % | n | % |
| Marital status | | | | |
| Never married/single, not otherwise specified | 131 | 75.7 | 96 | 36.9 |
| Married/civil union/domestic partnership | 31 | 17.9 | 91 | 35.0 |
| Divorced/married, but separated | 11 | 6.4 | 52 | 20.0 |
| Widowed | 0 | 0.0 | 21 | 8.1 |
| Injury location | | | | |
| House, apartment | 77 | 45.0 | 196 | 75.4 |
| Street/road, sidewalk, alley | 53 | 31.0 | 7 | 2.7 |
| Parking lot/public parking garage | 11 | 6.4 | 9 | 3.5 |
| Motor vehicle | 8 | 4.7 | 13 | 5.0 |
| Natural area (eg, field, river, beaches, woods) | 4 | 2.3 | 16 | 6.2 |
| Other | 18 | 10.5 | 19 | 7.3 |
| Injury at victim home | | | | |
| Yes | 48 | 28.2 | 187 | 71.6 |
| No | 122 | 71.8 | 74 | 28.4 |
| Firearm caliber or gauge | | | | |
| 9 mm | 32 | 29.9 | 23 | 10.0 |
| .22 in | 13 | 12.1 | 42 | 18.3 |
| .40 in | 17 | 15.9 | 17 | 7.4 |
| .38 in | 10 | 9.3 | 41 | 17.9 |
| .45 in | 9 | 8.4 | 14 | 6.1 |
| .357 in | 7 | 6.5 | 25 | 10.9 |
| .32 in | $<$ 5 b | | 16 | 7.0 |
| 12-gauge | $<$ 5 b | | 24 | 10.5 |
| Other | 14 | 13.1 | 27 | 11.8 |
| Firearm make | | | | |
| Smith & Wesson | 7 | 7.9 | 47 | 19.0 |
| Ruger, Sturm Ruger | 6 | 6.7 | 19 | 7.7 |
| Taurus | 5 | 5.6 | 16 | 6.5 |
| Mossberg/Lakefield Arms | 3 | 3.4 | 20 | 8.1 |
| Glock | 12 | 13.5 | 9 | 3.6 |
| Other | 56 | 63.0 | 136 | 55.0 |
| Number of bullets | | | | |
| 1 | 85 | 50.0 | 247 | 96.5 |
| 2 | 27 | 15.9 | 8 | 3.1 |
| 3 | 17 | 10.0 | 0 | 0.0 |
| ≥4 | 41 | 24.1 | $<\!5^{b}$ | |
| | | | (conti | nues) |

TABLE 2

Characteristics of Firearm Homicide/Legal Intervention and Suicide Death, Rhode Island, 2005-2014^a (*Continued*)

| | | ention 173) | | cide 261) |
|----------------------------------|----|----------------|--------------|--------------|
| Characteristics of Firearm Death | n | % | n | % |
| Number of wounds | | | | |
| 1 | 65 | 38.7 | 150 | 59.1 |
| 2 | 30 | 17.9 | 100 | 39.4 |
| 3 | 19 | 11.3 | $<$ 5 b | |
| ≥4 | 54 | 32.1 | $<$ 5 b | |
| Wound to body part ^c | | | | |
| Wound to head | 64 | 38.1 | 215 | 84.0 |
| Wound to abdomen | 37 | 22.6 | 4 | 1.7 |
| Wound to face | 20 | 12.3 | 28 | 11.7 |
| Wound to thorax | 70 | 43.2 | 15 | 6.2 |
| Wound to upper extremity | 69 | 42.1 | 10 | 4.1 |
| Wound to lower extremity | 28 | 17.1 | $<$ 5 b | |
| Wound to neck | 21 | 12.8 | 6 | 2.5 |
| Wound to spine | 10 | 6.1 | $<\!5^{b}$ | |

^a From Rhode Island Violent Death Reporting System. Percentages might not total 100% because of rounding.

TABLE 3

Toxicology Tests of Firearm Homicide/Legal Intervention and Suicide Deaths, Rhode Island 2005-2014^{a,b}

| Toxicology Test | Homici Interventio | Suicide (n = 261) | | |
|------------------------------|-----------------------|----------------------|-----|------|
| of Firearm Death | n | % | n | % |
| Tested | 169 | 97.7 | 257 | 98.5 |
| Toxicology test positive | | | | |
| Any toxicology | 119 | 70.4 | 143 | 55.6 |
| Any illicit substance | 118 | 69.8 | 126 | 49.0 |
| Alcohol | 49 | 29.0 | 85 | 33.1 |
| $BAC < 0.08 \; g/dL$ | 16 | | 17 | |
| $BAC \ge \! 0.08 \; g/dL$ | 33 | | 68 | |
| Marijuana | 76 | 45.5 | 21 | 8.2 |
| Opiates | 22 | 13.0 | 34 | 13.3 |
| Cocaine | 21 | 12.4 | 12 | 4.7 |
| Antidepressants | 6 | 3.6 | 36 | 14.1 |
| Abbraviation DAC blood alash | al canaantration | | | |

Abbreviation: BAC, blood alcohol concentration.

 $^{^{\}it b}$ The number of deaths are 5 or fewer; the number has been suppressed to retain confidentiality.

^c Percentages might exceed 100% because multiple wounds might have been coded.

^a From Rhode Island Violent Death Reporting System.

^b Subcategories do not sum to 100% because test results of victims can be positive for alcohol or multidrugs.

| | Homicide/Legal Intervention (n = 173) | | | | Suicide (n = 261) | |
|---------------------------------|--|------|---|-----|----------------------|--|
| Circumstance of Firearm Death N | | % | Circumstance of Firearm Death | n | % | |
| Reported | 108 | 65.1 | Reported | 249 | 95.4 | |
| Crime and criminal activity | | | Mental health/substance abuse | | | |
| | | | Current depressed mood | 129 | 49.4 | |
| Precipitated by another crime | 25 | 15.1 | Current diagnosed mental health problem | 105 | 40.2 | |
| Drug trade | 15 | | Depression/dysthymia | 87 | | |
| Robbery | 7 | | Anxiety disorder | 19 | | |
| Assault | 5 | | Bipolar disorder | 10 | | |
| Other | 5 | | Other | 25 | | |
| Crime in progress ^c | 18 | 10.8 | History of ever being treated for a mental health problem | 104 | 39.9 | |
| Drug involvement | 16 | 9.6 | Current mental health treatment | 88 | 33.7 | |
| Gang related | 5 | 3.2 | Alcohol problem | 35 | 13.4 | |
| | | | Other substance abuse problem | 23 | 8.8 | |
| Interpersonal | | | Interpersonal | | | |
| Intimate partner violence | 16 | 9.6 | Intimate partner problem | 61 | 23.4 | |
| Jealousy (lovers' triangle) | 11 | 6.6 | Other relationship problem (nonintimate) | 19 | 7.3 | |
| | | | Family relationship problem | 17 | 6.5 | |
| | | | Other death of family member/friend within past 5 years | 17 | 6.5 | |
| Life stressor | | | Life stressor | | | |
| Argument or conflict | 39 | 23.5 | Argument or conflict | 13 | 5.0 | |
| | | | Physical health problem | 80 | 30.7 | |
| | | | Crisis within previous or upcoming 2 wk | 54 | 20.7 | |
| | | | Job problem | 50 | 19.2 | |
| | | | Financial problem | 45 | 17.2 | |
| | | | Noncriminal legal problem | 15 | 5.8 | |
| | | | Recent criminal legal problem | 14 | 5.4 | |
| | | | Eviction or loss of home | 13 | 5.0 | |
| Homicide event | | | Suicide event | | | |
| Drive-by shooting | 13 | 7.8 | Left a suicide note | 88 | 33.7 | |
| Victim used a weapon | 12 | 7.2 | Suicide disclosure | 60 | 23.0 | |
| Justifiable self-defense | 11 | 6.6 | History of suicide attempt | 26 | 10.0 | |
| Victim was bystander | 5 | 3.0 | History of suicidal thoughts or plan | 16 | 6.1 | |

^a From Rhode Island Violent Death Reporting System.

denominators were unknown.²³ Therefore, if we reported rates, the majority would be blank. As the population in Rhode Island has been stable for more than 10 years (1.056 million in 2015 and 2016),²⁵ trends are unlikely to be affected by age population changes during the study period. Ten years of data were pooled to increase numbers. We used the Healthcare Cost and Utilization Project cost-to-charge ratios to convert total hospital charges to costs.²⁶ The number and percentage were not reported when the number of

decedents was less than 5 to maintain confidentiality. The analysis was performed using SAS (v9.4; SAS Institute Inc, Cary, North Carolina).

Results

The characteristics of Rhode Island firearm-related injury patients and decedents are summarized in Supplemental Digital Content Appendix Table A, available at http://links.lww.com/JPHMP/A430.

^bPercentages might exceed 100% because multiple circumstances might have been coded.

^cDenominator includes only those decedents involved in an incident that was precipitated by another crime.

During 2005-2014, a total of 869 Rhode Island ED visits (not admitted to the hospital) were due to firearm-related injuries. More than half (55.8%) of firearm-related ED visits were due to assaults/legal intervention and 32.7% were unintentional. There were 519 firearm-related hospital admissions in Rhode Island during this decade, of which 79.2% represented assaults/legal intervention. We do not have data on alcohol/substance use among those with firearm-related injuries in Rhode Island. Most firearm assault injury victims were 15 to 24 years of age, black and Hispanic, living in 4 core cities (Central Falls, Pawtucket, Providence, Woonsocket), self-pay, and discharged to home.

During the same time period, there were 434 firearm-related deaths, of which suicide accounted for 60.1% (n = 261) and homicide, 39.9% (n = 173). Most firearm homicide victims were young (aged 15-24 years), male (86%), black and Hispanic, resided in core cities, and used handguns. In contrast, most firearm suicide victims were middle aged (aged 45-64 years), male (91%), non-Hispanic white, resided in suburban regions, and used handguns (see Supplemental Digital Content Appendix Table A, available at http://links.lww.com/JPHMP/A430).

The average charge for each firearm-related ED visit (n = 87) (not leading to hospital admission) was approximately \$3800, representing hospital charges of approximately \$330000 and approximately \$107000 paid by insurance companies each year (Table 1). The average charge per firearm-related hospital admission (n = 52) (including ED visits that led to admission) was approximately \$50000, resulting in more than \$2.5 million in hospital charges per year. Among these hospital admissions, the average annual length of stay was 380 days, and the total costs paid by insurance companies were more than \$830000.

Clear patterns of firearm homicides and suicides were identified (Table 2). During 2005-2014, of the 173 firearm homicides, 71.8% of the victims were injured outside of their home (with 31% injured on street/road, sidewalk, or alley). In comparison, of the 261 firearm suicides, 71.6% were injured in their home. Most decedents, regardless of cause of death, were injured with a handgun. Nearly 46% of the homicide decedents were killed by 9 mm or .40 caliber guns, and Glock was the most common maker. In contrast, 36% of the suicide victims used .22 or .38 caliber guns to kill themselves, and Smith & Wesson was the most common maker. Almost 97% of suicide decedents died of 1 bullet, and 96% of them had wounds to the head or the face. Toxicology tests were conducted for nearly all decedents and results showed that almost 70% of the firearm homicide decedents and 49% of the firearm suicide decedents tested positive for illicit substances on postmortem analysis (Table 3). Alcohol (29%), marijuana (45.5%), opiates (13%), and cocaine (12.4%) were most commonly identified in postmortem toxicological analysis of homicide decedents. Alcohol (33.1%), antidepressants (14.1%), and opiates (13.3%) were most commonly identified in postmortem toxicological analysis of suicide decedents.

Nearly a quarter (23.5%) of firearm homicides were due to a conflict between the decedent and suspect over money, property, or drugs (Table 4); only 15.1% of firearm homicides were precipitated by another crime, and 9.6% were directly attributed to intimate partner violence. In contrast, the most common circumstance preceding firearm suicides was having current mental health problems (40.2%). Almost half (49.4%) of the suicide decedents were perceived by self or others to be depressed at the time of death, although only 33.7% were currently receiving mental health treatment. Intimate partner problems were reported as a related circumstance in 23.4% of suicides. Many Rhode Island firearm suicide decedents also experienced life stressors such as a crisis in the past 2 weeks (20.7%), physical health problems (30.7%), job problems (19.2%), or financial problems (17.2%) preceding their death. In one-third of the suicide cases (33.7%), the decedent left a suicide note.

Discussion

In this state-specific study, we combined easily available data sources to describe the epidemiology of firearm injury and death in a state with low firearm injury and death rates. Our analysis also provides novel state-specific data on cost, means of death, and presence of substances in decedents' toxicological analysis, which may inform state-specific prevention efforts. These findings are critically important in light of increasing national discussion of the need for geographically specific firearm injury prevention strategies²⁷ and in light of the lack of high-quality state-specific data.^{2,11,17,18,20} To the authors' knowledge, this is the first attempt to combine statewide ED, HD, and Violent Death Reporting System data to monitor the burden of firearm injury and death in a single state.

In the United States, the societal costs for all types of gun-related injuries and deaths were estimated at more than \$174 billion (direct costs: \$8.4 billion such as for emergency and medical care) and the government costs for firearm injuries were more than \$12 billion in 2010.^{5,28} In Rhode Island, a state with relatively low rates of firearm injury, this type of injury is still very costly: the mean cost (paid by

143

insurance companies) for gun-related ED visits was nearly \$110 000 per year and more than \$830 000 per year for firearm-related hospitalizations. More than half of the acute medical costs identified by this study were covered by Medicaid or Medicare, which are public insurance programs. Nationally, firearm injuries and deaths cost Medicare and Medicaid \$1.4 billion (acute care only, not including longterm care, physical therapy, etc) in 2010.²⁸ Gunshot wounds can leave survivors with long-term physical disabilities and chronic mental health problems, which are associated with high long-term as well as acute care costs.^{2,29} These consequences and high costs, largely born by government-funded health care systems, highlight the importance of prevention from a financial perspective.

Studies suggest that states with strong gun laws and lower gun ownership see lower firearm death rates.^{1,9} Rhode Island General laws require a person to have a license or permit to carry a pistol (§11-47-8) (http://webserver.rilin.state.ri.us/Statutes/). Rhode Islanders may obtain a permit in 1 of 2 ways: (1) by applying to the Rhode Island Attorney General's office (§11-47-18) and (2) by applying to the licensing authorities of any city or town (§11-47-11). A wait time and background check apply to most people who purchase a pistol or revolver (§11-47-35). Those persons who have a carry license under \$11-47-11 are exempt from the wait time and background check requirement. State law prohibits the possession of firearms on school grounds (§11-47-60) or at the workplace, unless a concealed carry permit from a licensing authority is obtained. Company policies about firearm carriage at a place of business are allowed to be stricter than state law.

In addition, there is very low household gun ownership (15.9%) in Rhode Island. These factors likely contributed to Rhode Island's ranking as having the second lowest gun death rate in the nation during 2014 (3.22/100 000).^{3,9} Yet, the epidemiology of firearm injury and death in our state mirrors that in national data. Most firearm-related ED visits and hospitalizations in Rhode Island in the last decade were due to assaults among young, minority men.^{2,13,17-20} Most firearm deaths were due to suicides among middle-aged, white men.^{2,11-13,17,18} These findings suggest that firearm injury prevention efforts may be generalizable across state lines, regardless of state-specific policies on firearm carriage.

Our analysis identifies a few areas of focus for future prevention work. First, our state-specific data support national work showing that alcohol is a major, immediately preceding risk factor for firearm death.¹³ Alcohol abuse is very common in Rhode Island; and data from the 2015 Rhode Island

Behavioral Risk Factor Surveillance System identify that 16% of Rhode Islanders were binge drinkers (≥ 5 drinks on 1 occasion for males, ≥ 4 for females) and 6.1% were heavy drinkers (>2 drinks per day for males, >1 for females). Nationally, firearm owners are significantly more likely than the general population to report binge drinking (odds ratio: 1.32, 95% confidence interval: 1.16-1.50) and heavy drinking (odds ratio: 1.45, 95% confidence interval: 1.14-1.83), and suicide is more likely to be due to firearms when alcohol is consumed prior to attempt.^{1,30} Alcohol intoxication may facilitate firearm use by fostering impulsive behavior and emotional impairment among suicide decedents.¹¹ To reduce firearm injuries and deaths, it is critically important to both treat alcohol misuse and reduce firearm access to patients in crisis who are using alcohol.^{1,13} Of note, the Rhode Island law \$11-47-6 (mental incompetents and drug addicts prohibited from possession of firearms) was recently amended such that a person who has been adjudicated or is under treatment or confinement as a habitual drunkard has been removed from the language. It is difficult to know whether this or other legislation would influence injury patterns.¹ Chen and Wu's³¹ meta-analysis study found that substance use is statistically significant related to firearm violence. Future large-scale and rigorous substance use research is needed to understand the relationship between substance use and firearm violence, and how best to change this relationship.³¹

Second, our data highlight the importance of improved access to mental health care in general and temporary reduction of access to firearms for acutely suicidal patients in particular. 11,32 In our state, only one-third of suicide decedents were reported to be receiving mental health treatment at the time of death. Other studies show that the decision to attempt suicide is made within a short period and without a plan.³³ Appropriate preventive interventions may need to be delivered not just by mental health professionals but also by internal medicine, pediatric, and emergency medicine physicians who care for these patients.¹¹ Protection of physicians' ability to have thoughtful conversations about firearm injury with atrisk patients is critically important.³⁴ In addition, programs such as the Harvard's Means Matters Program show that gun store owners and gun safety professionals can play an important role in preventing suicide among gun owners and their family members.^{33,35} Active partnerships between suicide prevention groups, gun retailers, firearm safety instructors, firing range owners, and guns rights advocates may help create an opportunity for lifesaving conversations at the time of firearm purchase or firearm safety training. Future studies should examine whether proactive discussions

about firearms between medical or gun safety experts and at-risk community members would reduce the risk of fatal suicide attempts. 12,32,36

Third, our data show a high prevalence of recent intimate partner problems and crises among firearm. Our analysis is limited by the large amount of missing data on whether intimate partner homicide victims had prior restraining orders. The presence of a firearm in a domestic violence situation heightens the risk of homicide for the victims, their children, and bystanders; statistics show that the risk of homicide for women is 5 times greater when a firearm is present in a domestic violence situation.^{37,38} The perpetrator may also use the firearm as an implicit or explicit threat against the victims or their children as the perpetrator seeks to maintain power and control over the victim.³⁸ With the passage of the new state law, perpetrators are now restricted from possessing/purchasing firearms when a temporary restraining order is in place and after conviction of misdemeanor domestic violence crimes.39

Fourth, our data show that handguns were involved in most of the firearm-related homicides and suicides. Specifically, handguns were used in more than 60% of the firearm-related homicides and almost threequarters of the firearm-related suicides. We found that 36% of the suicide victims killed themselves using .22 or .38 caliber guns, which can be small, lightweight, and inexpensive. State-specific awareness of the means of injury and death may improve law enforcement and policy efforts to reduce injury. Finally, although our findings cannot comment on whether the firearms used for homicide and suicide were legally obtained, gun theft is an important source of firearms used by criminals.40 Future work could examine ways to reduce the accessibility of illegally obtained firearms and the influence of illegal firearms on homicide and suicide prevalence.

Limitations

This study is subject to some limitations: (1) ED visits, hospitalizations, and deaths that occurred in other states were not captured. (2) Our data do not include patients who sought care from urgent care facilities or in private physicians' offices, so our findings may overrepresent those with more serious firearm-related injuries, public health insurance, or self-pay.⁴¹ (3) Homicide and suicide circumstances are classified separately to adjust for homicide data generally being more difficult to obtain. Abstractors are limited to the information included in the investigative reports they receive, which may be unavailable until after prosecutions are complete.⁴² (4) Based on the

Implications for Policy & Practice

- Surveillance of firearm-related injury and death is essential. Surveillance data can provide the "who, when, where, and how" and eventually can lead to the "why."
- Dissemination of surveillance findings to key stakeholders is critical in improving firearm injury prevention. Examples of Rhode Island stakeholders include the Rhode Island Department of Health Violence and Injury Prevention Program, Rhode Island State Crime Laboratory, Rhode Island Coalition Against Domestic Violence, Institute for the Study and Practice of Nonviolence, Rhode Island Police Chief Association, police departments, Rhode Island Hospital Injury Prevention Center, Division of Elderly Affairs, Department of Corrections, and Behavioral Health, Developmental Disabilities and Hospitals.
- These groups participate on the Rhode Island Violent Death Reporting System Advisory Committee. Similar advisory groups of stakeholders can and should be developed in other states. Additional relevant stakeholders may include gun shop owners, firearm safety instructors, and other concerned community members.
- These decision makers and program planners can use the data to understand the magnitude, trends, and characteristics of firearm-related violence, discover patterns, identify risk factors, and target high-risk subgroups to reduce firearm injuries and fatalities.
- State health departments, police departments, social services, local agencies and organizations, and the media need to work together to improve access to mental health care in general (including substance abuse) and to identify and intervene with at-risk members of the community.
- States with statewide ED, HD, and violent death reporting system can adopt our analyses to inform their own data-driven prevention programs. States that are not part of the NVDRS could work with their other data sources (ED, HD, Vital Statistics System, National Incident-Based Reporting System) to understand general patterns and trends in firearm injuries and deaths and obtain a better picture of violent injuries and deaths to make the best use of resources.

low numbers, legal intervention cases are combined with assault/homicide cases. The CDC coding manual states that deaths from legal intervention is a subtype of homicide where the victim is killed by or died because of law enforcement acting in the line of duty.²⁴ However, legal intervention circumstances may be very different than regular homicide/assaults. Future studies could combine legal intervention homicides from multiple states. (5) The literature is mixed about the reliability of E-coding of hospital and ED billing records.^{41,43} Billing database coders are not

specifically trained in violence categorization and charts are rarely completed to inform injury prevention.⁴⁴

Conclusions

This study presents a novel statewide methodology to examine the epidemiology of firearm-related ED visits, HDs, and deaths. Understanding patterns (who, where, factors, etc) and the magnitude of the issue may help the state develop geographically specific firearm injury prevention strategies. Despite that this study was conducted in a state with very low overall rates of firearm injury and death, injury patterns and precedents were similar to those reported on a national level. The Rhode Island study can be shared with other states.

References

- 1. Wintemute GJ. Alcohol misuse, firearm violence perpetration, and public policy in the United States. *Prev Med.* 2015;79:15–21.
- Fowler KA, Dahlberg LL, Haileyesus T, Annest JL. Firearm injuries in the United States. Prev Med. 2015;79:5–14.
- Violence Policy Center. State firearm death rates, ranked by rate, 2014. Res Invest Ana Adv Saf Am. 2017. http://www.vpc.org/ fact-sheets/state-firearm-death-rates-ranked-by-rate-2014/.
- National Center for Injury Prevention and Control. Fatal injury reports, national, regional and state (restricted), 1999-2015. WISQARSTM. 2017. https://webappa.cdc.gov/sasweb/ncipc/mortrate.html.
- Gani F, Sakran JV, Canner JK. Emergency department visits for firearm-related injuries in the United States, 2006-14. Health Aff (Millwood). 2017;36:1729–1738.
- National Center for Injury Prevention and Control. Nonfatal injury reports, 2000-2015. WISQARSTM. 2017. https://webappa.cdc.gov/ sasweb/ncipc/nfirates.html.
- Thomas KE, Johnson RL. State injury indicators report: Instructions for preparing 2014 data. 2016. https://www.cdc.gov/injury/pdfs/2014_state_injury_indicator_instructions-a.pdf.
- 8. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. Rhode Island firearms death rate: deaths due to injury by firearms per 100,000 population. World Life Expectancy: Live Longer Live Better. 2014. http://www.worldlifeexpectancy.com/usa/rhode-island-firearms-death-rate.
- Violence Policy Center. States with weak gun laws and higher gun ownership lead nation in gun deaths, new data for 2014 confirms. Res Invest Ana Adv Saf Am. 2017. http://www.vpc.org/press/ states-with-weak-gun-laws-and-higher-gun-ownership-leadnation-in-gun-deaths-new-data-for-2014-confirms/.
- US Department of Health & Human Services. 2020 topics and objectives—objectives a-z. Healthy People 2020. 2017. https:// www.healthypeople.gov/2020/topics-objectives.
- Kaplan MS, McFarland BH, Huguet N. Characteristics of adult male and female firearm suicide decedents: findings from the national violent death reporting system. *Inj Prev.* 2009;15:322–327.
- Hempstead K, Nguyen T, David-Rus R, Jacquemin B. Health problems and male firearm suicide. Suicide Life Threat Behav. 2013;43:1–16
- 13. Hemenway D, Webster DW. Guest editorial: increasing knowledge for the prevention of firearm violence. *Prev Med.* 2015;79:3–4.
- Franco EL, Shinder GA, Tota JE, Isidean SD. An elusive low-hanging fruit for public health: gun violence prevention. *Prev Med*. 2015;79:1–2.
- Stark DE, Shah NH. Funding and publication of research on gun violence and other leading causes of death. JAMA. 2017;317: 84–85.

- Betz ME, Ranney ML, Wintemute GJ. Frozen funding on firearm research: "doing nothing is no longer an acceptable solution." West J Emerg Med. 2016;17:91–93.
- Sen B, Panjamapirom A. State background checks for gun purchase and firearm deaths: an exploratory study. *Prev Med.* 2012;55:346– 350
- Cook A, Osler T, Hosmer D, et al. Gunshot wounds resulting in hospitalization in the United States: 2004-2013. *Injury*. 2017;48:621–627.
- Zebib L, Stoler J, Zakrison TL. Geo-demographics of gunshot wound injuries in Miami-Dade County, 2002-2012. BMC Public Health. 2017;17:174.
- Barber C, Azrael D, Cohen A, et al. Homicides by police: comparing counts from the national violent death reporting system, vital statistics, and supplementary homicide reports. Am J Public Health. 2016;106:922–927.
- Injury Surveillance Workgroup 7. Consensus Recommendations for National and State Poisoning Surveillance. Atlanta, GA: Injury Surveillance Workgroup 7; 2012. http://c.ymcdn.com/sites/ www.safestates.org/resource/resmgr/imported/ISW7%20Full%20 Report_3.pdf.
- CDC/National Center for Health Statistics. ICD-coding of firearm injuries. 2015. https://www.cdc.gov/nchs/injury/ice/amsterdam1998/amsterdam1998_guncodes.htm.
- Lyons BH, Fowler KA, Jack SP, Betz CJ, Blair JM. Surveillance for violent deaths—national violent death reporting system, 17 states, 2013. MMWR Surveill Summ. 2016;65:1–42.
- Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. National Violent Death Reporting System (NVDRS) Coding Manual Revised [online]. Atlanta, GA: Centers for Disease Control and Prevention; 2016. https://www.cdc.gov/violenceprevention/pdf/nvdrs_web_codingmanual.pdf.
- 25. United States Census Bureau. Quickfacts—selected: Rhode island. *QuickFacts*. 2017. https://www.census.gov/quickfacts/Rl.
- 26. Healthcare Cost and Utilization Project (HCUP). Cost-to-charge ratio files. 2017. https://www.hcup-us.ahrq.gov/db/state/costtocharge.jsp.
- Branas CC, Culhane D, Richmond TS, Wiebe DJ. Novel linkage of individual and geographic data to study firearm violence. *Homicide* Stud. 2008;12:298–320.
- Children's Safety Network. The cost of firearm violence.
 https://www.childrenssafetynetwork.org/publications/cost-firearm-violence.
- National Center for Injury Prevention and Control. DVP digest: June-July 2016. DVP Digest. 2016. http://www.ncdsv.org/CDC_ DVP-Digest_Jun-Jul-2016.pdf.
- Wintemute GJ. Association between firearm ownership, firearmrelated risk and risk reduction behaviours and alcohol-related risk behaviours. *Inj Prev.* 2011;17:422–427.
- 31. Chen D, Wu LT. Association between substance use and gunrelated behaviors. *Epidemiol Rev.* 2016;38:46–61.
- Wanta BT, Schlotthauer AE, Guse CE, Hargarten SW. The burden of suicide in Wisconsin's older adult population. WMJ. 2009;108: 87–93
- Vriniotis M, Barber C, Frank E, Demicco R. A suicide prevention campaign for firearm dealers in New Hampshire. Suicide Life Threat Behav. 2015;45:157–163.
- 34. Wintemute GJ, Betz ME, Ranney ML. Yes, you can: physicians, patients, and firearms. *Ann Intern Med.* 2016;165:205–213.
- Barber C, Frank E, Demicco R. Reducing suicides through partnerships between health professionals and gun owner groups-beyond docs vs glocks. *JAMA Intern Med*. 2017;177:5–6.
- Roszko PJ, Ameli J, Carter PM, Cunningham RM, Ranney ML. Clinician attitudes, screening practices, and interventions to reduce firearm-related injury. *Epidemiol Rev.* 2016;38:87–110.
- Campbell JC, Webster D, Koziol-McLain J, et al. Risk factors for femicide in abusive relationships: results from a multisite case control study. Am J Public Health. 2003;93:1089–1097.
- Rhode Island Coalition Against Domestic Violence. Domestic violence homicides in Rhode Island 2006-2015. 2017. http://www.ricadv.org/en/what-we-do/policy/new-report-domestic-violence-homicides-in-rhode-island-2006-2015.

- State of Rhode Island in General Assembly. An act relating to courts and civil procedure-courts-domestic assault-protect Rhode Island families act. 2017-H 5510 Substitute B as Amended. 2017. http://webserver.rilin.state.ri.us/BillText/BillText17/HouseText17/ H5510Baa.pdf.
- Hemenway D, Azrael D, Miller M. Whose guns are stolen? The epidemiology of gun theft victims. *Inj Epidemiol*. 2017;4:11.
- 41. Ranney ML, Verhoek-Oftedahl W, Rommel J, Mello MJ. Analysis of intentional and unintentional injuries caused by firearms and cutting/piercing instruments among providence youth, Nov 2004-Dec 2007. *Med Health R I.* 2009;92:200–203.
- 42. Parks SE, Johnson LL, McDaniel DD, Gladden M. Surveillance for violent deaths—national violent death reporting system, 16 states, 2010. *MMWR Surveill Summ.* 2014;63: 1–33.
- Bota GW, Therrien SA, Rowe BH. A truncated e-code system for injury surveillance in the emergency department: description and clinometric testing. Acad Emerg Med. 1997;4: 291–296.
- 44. Ranney ML, Mello MJ. A comparison of female and male adolescent victims of violence seen in the emergency department. *J Emerg Med.* 2011;41:701–706.