

Author of paper _____

Reviewer # _____

Key: 1 = completely unconvincing
2 = okay, but some major flaws exist
3 = fairly solid, but some minor flaws exist
4 = completely convincing

A. Did the speaker establish the topic with both literature and sound logic? 1 2 3 4

Justification for your score: _____

B1. *Proposals only*: Do the methods address the question and are they doable? 1 2 3 4

Justification for your score: _____

B2. *Reviews only*: Did the speaker make a central point, supported by a variety of sources? 1 2 3 4

Justification for your score: _____

C. Presentation Style: Was the talk easy to understand? 1 2 3 4

Justification for your score: _____

Total score (add up scores, i.e. A+B+C) _____ (note score will range from 3 to 12)