Hierarchical Regression Example

Salary and Publications Example (Cohen, Cohen, West, & Aiken, Table 3.2.1)

Hierarchical regression involves entering variables into the regression model on two or more steps. Any number of variables can be entered on any one step (or "block") and any number of steps can be used. This type of analysis seems less common in recent years, but is sometimes used to examine the percentage of additional variance accounted for by a set of variables over and above the variance accounted for by another set of variables. I illustrate with a very simple two-variable model below, with one variable entered on each step, in order to compare to the simultaneous model illustrated in the previous multiple regression example handout. The term "hierarchical" is sometimes used for a different analysis, called "hierarchical linear modeling" designed for nested data like schools, and should not be confused with the regression approach illustrated here. There is also an approach to building regression models called "stepwise regression," which is an exploratory approach (discussed soon) and is not the same as this approach, because in hierarchical regression the researcher chooses which variables to enter in which order.

Below are two hierarchical regression examples, both with the number of publications and the years since PhD predicting salary, but with the two variables entered in different orders. It would be very uncommon to retest a model using different orderings, but I want to illustrate that on the final step, the two models are the same and equal to the previously illustrated simultaneous model results, and the order that they are entered does not matter once you get to the final step. See also that the first step with just one variable is the same as a simple regression or correlation.

Entering PUBS First

SPSS Syntax

correlations vars=pubs time salary.

regression vars=salary time pubs /descriptives=mean stdev /statistics=anova r coeff ses cha /dependent=salary /method=enter pubs /enter time.

| | | pubs number of publications | time years since PhD | salary annual salary in dollars |
|-------------------------|---------------------|--------------------------------|-------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| pubs number of | Pearson Correlation | 1 | .657 | .588 |
| publications | Sig. (2-tailed) | | .008 | .021 |
| | N | 15 | 15 | 15 |
| time years since PhD | Pearson Correlation | .657 | 1 | .710 |
| | Sig. (2-tailed) | .008 | | .003 |
| | N | 15 | 15 | 15 |
| salary annual salary in | Pearson Correlation | .588 | .710 | 1 |
| dollars | Sig. (2-tailed) | .021 | .003 | |
| | N | 15 | 15 | 15 |

| | | | | | Change Statistics | | | | |
|-------|-------------------|----------|----------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------|----------|-----|-----|---------------|
| Model | R | R Square | Adjusted R Square | Std. Error of the Estimate | R Square Change | F Change | df1 | df2 | Sig. F Change |
| 1 | .588 ^a | .346 | .295 | 6623.61975 | .346 | 6.864 | 1 | 13 | .021 |
| 2 | .728 ^b | .530 | .452 | 5839.23054 | .185 | 4.727 | 1 | 12 | .050 |

ANOVAª

| | | Sum of | | | | |
|-------|------------|--------------|----|--------------|-------|-------------------|
| Model | | Squares | df | Mean Square | F | Sig. |
| 1 | Regression | 301137778.67 | 1 | 301137778.67 | 6.864 | .021 ^b |
| | Residual | 570340400.93 | 13 | 43872338.533 | | |
| | Total | 871478179.60 | 14 | | | |
| 2 | Regression | 462318820.34 | 2 | 231159410.17 | 6.780 | .011 ^c |
| | Residual | 409159359.26 | 12 | 34096613.272 | | |
| | Total | 871478179.60 | 14 | | | |

^{a.} Dependent Variable: salary annual salary in dollars

^{b.} Predictors: (Constant), pubs number of publications

^{c.} Predictors: (Constant), pubs number of publications, time years since PhD

Coefficients a

| | | Unstandardized Coefficients | | Standardized (| Coefficients | | |
|-------|--------------------------------|-----------------------------|------------|----------------|--------------|--------|-------|
| Model | | В | Std. Error | Beta | Std. Error | t | Sig. |
| 1 | (Constant) | 46357.449 | 3072.730 | | | 15.087 | <.001 |
| | pubs number of publications | 335.526 | 128.067 | .588 | .224 | 2.620 | .021 |
| 2 | (Constant) | 43082.394 | 3099.493 | | | 13.900 | <.001 |
| | pubs number of publications | 121.801 | 149.699 | .213 | .262 | .814 | .432 |
| | time years since PhD | 982.867 | 452.057 | .570 | .262 | 2.174 | .050 |

^{a.} Dependent Variable: salary annual salary in dollars

Entering TIME First

Syntax

```
regression vars=salary time pubs
   /descriptives=mean stdev
   /statistics=anova r coeff ses cha
   /dependent=salary
   /method=enter time /enter pubs.
```

Variables Entered/Removed ^a

| Model | Variables Entered | Variables Removed | Method |
|-------|---|----------------------|--------|
| 1 | time years since PhD ^b | | Enter |
| 2 | pubs number of publications ^b | | Enter |

 Dependent Variable: salary annual salary in dollars

^{b.} All requested variables entered.

Model Summary

| | | | | | Change Statistics | | | | |
|-------|-------------------|----------|----------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------|----------|-----|-----|---------------|
| Model | R | R Square | Adjusted R Square | Std. Error of the Estimate | R Square Change | F Change | df1 | df2 | Sig. F Change |
| 1 | .710 ^a | .505 | .466 | 5762.82286 | .505 | 13.241 | 1 | 13 | .003 |
| 2 | .728 ^b | .530 | .452 | 5839.23054 | .026 | .662 | 1 | 12 | .432 |

^{a.} Predictors: (Constant), time years since PhD

^{b.} Predictors: (Constant), time years since PhD, pubs number of publications

ANOVAª

| Model | | Sum of Squares | df | Mean Square | F | Sig. |
|-------|------------|-------------------|----|--------------|--------|-------------------|
| 1 | Regression | 439746525.09 | 1 | 439746525.09 | 13.241 | .003 ^b |
| | Residual | 431731654.51 | 13 | 33210127.270 | | |
| | Total | 871478179.60 | 14 | | | |
| 2 | Regression | 462318820.34 | 2 | 231159410.17 | 6.780 | .011 ^c |
| | Residual | 409159359.26 | 12 | 34096613.272 | | |
| | Total | 871478179.60 | 14 | | | |

^{a.} Dependent Variable: salary annual salary in dollars

^{b.} Predictors: (Constant), time years since PhD

^{c.} Predictors: (Constant), time years since PhD, pubs number of publications

Coefficients ^a

| | | Unstandardized | Coefficients | ficients Standardized C | | | |
|-------|-----------------------------|----------------|--------------|-------------------------|------------|--------|-------|
| Model | | В | Std. Error | Beta | Std. Error | t | Sig. |
| 1 | (Constant) | 43658.594 | 2978.022 | | | 14.660 | <.001 |
| | time years since PhD | 1224.392 | 336.476 | .710 | .195 | 3.639 | .003 |
| 2 | (Constant) | 43082.394 | 3099.493 | | | 13.900 | <.001 |
| | time years since PhD | 982.867 | 452.057 | .570 | .262 | 2.174 | .050 |
| | pubs number of publications | 121.801 | 149.699 | .213 | .262 | .814 | .432 |

^{a.} Dependent Variable: salary annual salary in dollars

R Code (Pubs-First Model Only)

For the hierarchical model in R, I use the 1m function and test two separate models then request the comparison using the anova function. Only the model with publications entered first is illustrated.

```
> #hierarchical regression using base R function lm
> model1 = lm(SALARY~PUBS, data=d)
model2 = lm(CALARY_PUBS, tTTTC_data=d)
> model2 = lm(SALARY~PUBS + TIME, data=d)
> summary(model1)
Call:
lm(formula = SALARY ~ PUBS, data = mydata)
Residuals:
                  1Q
                          Median
Min 1Q
-10597.7 -6320.8
                                            30
                                                       Max
                          -520.9
                                       5328.4
                                                   9801.6
Coefficients:
               Estimate Std. Error t value Pr(>|t|)
46357.4 3072.7 15.09 0.00000000129
335.5 128.1 2.62 0.0212
(Intercept) 46357.4
PUBS 335.5
Residual standard error: 6624 on 13 degrees of freedom
Multiple R-squared: 0.3455, Adjusted R-squared: 0.2952
F-statistic: 6.864 on 1 and 13 DF, p-value: 0.02119
> summary(model2)
Call:
lm(formula = SALARY ~ PUBS + TIME, data = mydata)
Residuals:
               1Q Median
                                 3Q
   Min
                                         Мах
-12066 -3522
                               3324
                     -342
                                        8847
Coefficients:
                Estimate Std. Error t value
                                                            Pr(>|t|)
                                 3099.5 13.900 0.0000000926
149.7 0.814 0.4317
(Intercept) 43082.4
                    121.8
PUBS
                    982.9
                                   452.1
                                                               0.0504
TIME
                                             2.174
Residual standard error: 5839 on 12 degrees of freedom
F-statistic: 6.78 on 2 and 12 DF, p-value: 0.01071
                                                                 0.4522
> anova(model1,model2)
Analysis of Variance Table
Model 1: SALARY ~ PUBS
Model 2: SALARY ~ PUBS + TIME
  Res.Df
                   RSS Df Sum of Sq
                                                  F Pr(>F)
        13 570340401
1
        12 409159359 1 161181042 4.7272 0.05041
2
```

#use the z-score method or the lm.beta package as previously illustrated for standardized coefficients for either the first or second model.

Write-up

I won't provide an additional write-up here, because it would be mostly redundant with the write-up for the simultaneous regression. To report a hierarchical regression, be sure to state that a hierarchical approach was used, which variables were entered on which step, and include the R-squared change and significance (e.g., for the second step, R^2 change = .03, F(1,12) = .66, p = .43) for each group of variables added to the model (except the first block). A table will likely be helpful if there are several variables added at a time and/or several steps. See "Overhead: Good Example of Hierarchical Table" for an illustration.